An Analysis of Grammatical Errors in Writing The Procedure Text of The Ninth Grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi in 2022/2023

Veronika Nurdelima Mendrofa¹, Adieli Laoli²
¹ Universitas Nias Gunungsitoli, Indonesia; ikaveronika673@yahoo.com
² Universitas Nias Gunungsitoli, Indonesia; laoliadieli65@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Error Analysis;
Procedure text;
Writing Skills

ABSTRACT

This research is aimed to investigate the errors made by the ninth grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi in writing procedure text. It intends to (1) identify the types of errors done by the students in writing procedure text, and (2) find the causes of the errors. It applied a qualitative research. The participants were 20 students of ninth grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi. The data were the procedure text written by the students. Those described the types of errors. Then questionnaires got from the english teacher and students described the cause of errors. Results of the data analysis indicated that there were 182 frequencies of errors done by 20 students. The types of errors done by students were omission, addition, misinformation and misordering. The frequencies of omission type done by students were 48 (26.37%). The frequencies of addition done by students were 32 (17.58%). The frequencies of misinformation done by students were 66 (36.26%). The frequencies of misordering done by students were 36 (19.78%). These errors are caused the lack of target language knowledge (intralingual errors). They consisted of lack of vocabulary, spelling, the use of plural and making noun phrases. The second cause was the frist language or mother tongue (interlingual errors). There the errors caused by the influence of first language.

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-SA license.

1. INTRODUCTION

In Indonesia, English is a foreign language but it should be learnt because it is an international language. Absolutely it is important to be learnt by people of Indonesia. Learning English is not an easy activity because it has some differences way in mastering Indonesian. They may have the differences of sound, symbol, structure and also words. Therefore in making English as a tool of communication among of students at some of school in Indonesia, is still hard.

Generally there are five types of communication, namely verbal communication, non-verbal communication, written communication, listening, and visual communication (Willkomm, 2018).
spoken communication the language user are expected to sound or express their ideas orally. Then the process of communicating a message through written symbols is called as written communication (Mukhibat, 2016). In this case the writers are expected to express their thought through text. So they have to get some skills in arranging words to be sentences, sentences to be paragraph and paragraph to be text. It is a productive skill which not only involves graphic representation of the expressions but also develops and presents thoughts in a structured way. So the writer needs to learn and practice (Durga & Rao, 2018).

At public school, the students such as at Junior High School and Senior High School are taught to write in English with some variation or types of text. It can be proved by the syllabus, handbook of Junior High School, and curriculum. One type of text the students learnt at Junior High School level is procedure. A procedural text is any piece of writing that gives step-by-step instructions on how to do or make something (Mubarok, Aminah, Sukamto, Suherman, & Berlian, 2021). It comes from the word “procedure” where you have to follow an order of steps to achieve a goal.

Procedure text has the generic structure. The first is goal. It states about what will be made. The second is materials or ingredients. They are list of materials will be used in making something. The third are steps. They are procedures of making something (Sanjaya, 2012). In writing procedure text the writer are not only expected to master the generic structure but also the grammar. Here the writer have to master the structure of present tense because the language feature of procedure text is using present tense in verbal, nominal and passive voice form. If the sentences are not arranged into good grammar, they will create misunderstanding or incorrect procedure.

Talking about the material and learning outcome has been explained previously means that the students at ninth grade have the good ability in writing procedure text after learning it. In reality after the researcher observed the procedure text written by students at ninth grade at SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi showed that some of students made grammatical error in writing procedure text. Grammatical error is a term used in prescriptive grammar to describe an instance of faulty, unconventional, or controversial usage, such as a misplaced modifier or an inappropriate verb tense, (Nordquist, 2020). Futhermore according to Burt and Kiparsky (Aprianty, 2018), grammatical error is an error that violates grammatical rules in a language and it makes someone's writing becomes not good to be seen by readers. In other words it can be said that grammatical error is the incorrect arrangement of words in sentence.

Based on the observation, on some procedure texts done by students at ninth grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi found some incorrect grammar such as, “Put two spoon sugar on cup.” Concerning to grammar, this text is incorrect. Spoon is a noun so it should be added “s” because “two” indicates the plural. Then sugar is also a noun. It is better if there is a preposition placed between spoons and sugar. And then at the end of the sentence there is a noun “cup”. Here cup is a place. So the appropriate preposition of place used is “into”. Then it is followed by “the” as article. So the sentence can be corrected be, “Put two spoons of sugar into the cup. In this case the researcher assumes that the students makes some types of error. As stated by Corder error has four categories namely error of omission, error of addition, error of selection, and error of ordering. This error may caused by some factors. There are three causes of errors, namely carelessness, first language interference, and translation, (Norrish 1983). This problem attracted the researcher do research entitled, “An Analysis of Grammatical Errors in Writing The Procedure Text of the Ninth Grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi.

2. METODE

In conducting this research the researcher applied qualitative design. It aimed at describing and clarifying human experience as it appears in people’s life and gather data that serve as evidence for their distilled description, (D E Polkinghorne, 2005). It involves a way for an individual or community to determine the importance of addressing social or human issues (Creswell, 2013).
The object of this research are the error components in writing procedure text done by students of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi, especially ninth grade.

The data were procedure text have written by 20 students, teachers’ and students’ questionnaires sheets to get the reasons or factors caused the students making errors in writing procedure text. The researcher got the procedure text from the students by giving test. The researcher came in the classroom then ask the students to prepare the answer sheet of the test. After that the researcher instructed the students to write a procedure text based on the topic they interest. After one hour, the researcher asked them to collect the answer sheet they did. Then the researcher analyzed those text one by one. From the text the researcher identify and code the errors made by the students. After analyzing the error made by the students the researcher classified and making presentage to get the dominant and types errors done by the students. After that the researcher prepare the questionnaires to be distributed to students and teacher in order to get the reason or cause why did students made the errors in writing procedure text.

3. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

Definition of error

Every language learners, both native and non-native make errors in their learning process. Errors are those parts of conversation or composition that deviate from some selected norm of mature language performance. People cannot learn language without first systematically committing errors (S. D. Krashen, 1982). In addition, (Richards & Renadya, 2002) states that error is unintentionally deviant and is not self-correctible by its author, it cannot be self-corrected by the learner until further relevant input that has been provided and converted into intake by the learners. In other words, the learner needs to be provided the further relevant learning before they can correct themselves.

Learner’s errors are indicated by both of the state of the learner’s knowledge, and of the ways in which a second language is learned. Sentences containing errors would be characterized by systematic deviancy. In addition, (Daft, 2002) states: Error is a study of errors made by the second and foreign language students. Error may be carried out in order to find out how well someone knows a language, to find out how a person learns a language, and obtain information on common difficulties in language learning, as an aid in teaching or in the preparation of teaching materials.

To sum up, errors cannot be separated of language learning. Error is an activity to identify, classify, interpret or describe the errors made by the students in writing and it is carried out to identify the ability of the students and to obtain information on common difficulties faced by the students. Students’ error is the target source of the researcher’s intention of the research. In addition, developmental errors illustrate the learner attempting to build up hypotheses about English language from his limited experiences of it in the classroom or textbook.

Types of error

In conducting the error analysis research, the researcher should propose some classification of error depending on the location of error made by the students based on the theory. To know the type of error needed in the process of analyzing. (Henslin, 2020; S. Krashen, 2004) classify errors in four types, they are:

a. Error of Omission. Omission errors are characterized by the absence of an item that must appear in a well-formed utterance. Omission errors occur when an element of the sentence that could be presented is omitted or by absence of an item that must appear in a well-formed utterance and it often occurs in form of morpheme. For example: “Prepare a spoon sugar.” It should be “Prepare a spoon of sugar.”

b. Error of Addition. Addition errors are the opposite of omissions. They are characterized by the presence of an item which should not appear in a well-formed utterance. There are three types of addition errors, they are: 1) Double marking, two items rather than one are marked for the same
feature. For example: “Add with not many sugar.” It should be add some of sugar. 2) Regularizations, a marker that is typically added to a linguistic item is erroneously added to exceptional items of the given class that do not take a marker. For example “Put some water into the glass. It should be “Put some water into the glass.” 3) Simple additions, if an addition error is not a double marking or regularization, it is called a simple addition. “After boiling noodle then, turn of the stove.” It should be, “after boiling the noodle, turn of the stove.”

c. Error of Misiformation. Misinformation errors are characterized by the use of the wrong form of the morpheme or structure. While in omission errors the item is not supplied at all, in misinformation errors the learner supplies something, although it is incorrect. For example: “Don’t cook to long while it can be charred. It should be, “don’t cook to long because it can be charred.”
d. Error of Misordering. Errors of misordering are characterized by the incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in an utterance. For example: “Mix a half of glass flour wheat with dough. It should be, “Mix a half of wheat flour with dough.”

Regarding to those opinion above, the researcher will classify the errors will be made by students into four types namely: omission (the absence of an word/item), addition (the presence of an item/word that must be appear), misinformation (choosing the wrong item in the right place), misordering (the items presented correctly but wrongly sequences).

Sources of error

In conducting the research, it is quite important to know the source of errors made by the students. In other hand, the researcher should classify the components which effect the students in making error. According to (Hourani, 2008), the students’ errors commonly is caused by the language transfer of the student itself. There are two major sources of students’ errors; they are intralingual transfer and interlingual transfer.

a. Interlingual transfer. Interlingual transfer is a strategy used by the beginner with combine mother tongue and second language. It means that the students try to mix their language when they practice English as their second language. Moreover, the effect of this method the beginner felt difficult to organize their language in writing. Then, the beginner make a errors language in their writing.

b. Intralingual Transfer. Intralingual transfer is errors factor made by the students because the target language that the students studied was different with their mother tongue. Moreover, the learner confused with the structural of second language. Consequently, the learner made errors in their writing.

Based on the theories above, it can be said that students’ error in language learning caused by interlingual transfer where the students are affected by the students’ first language in their learning of second language while intralingual transfer affected by lack of students’ knowledge of target language.

Error analysis

Error analysis is a tool to help the researcher to check the grammatical errors made by students especially using tenses in narrative text. According to (Hourani, 2008), “Error analysis is an essential source of information to teachers. It provides information on students’ errors which in turn helps teachers to correct students’ errors and also improves the effectiveness of their teaching”. In other words, error analysis is very important because the researcher will investigate the types of errors done by students of using past tense in writing narrative text and the factors that influence their errors.

According to (Richards & Renadya, 2002), the fact that the learners do make errors and that these errors can be observed, analyzed, and classified to reveal something of the system operating within learner, led to measure of study of learners errors, called error analysis. It means that, it is possible for students to make error in learning second language, because it expects the learners to learn from their
own mistakes. Hence, Error analysis is a tool to help the researcher to identify and describe the students’ error and its causes in narrative text in order to know how well the students learn the target language.

Writing

Writing is one of the productive skills to share information to readers in written language to give an idea or message that should be mastered by the student. It is supported by (Rivers, 1981), “Writing is conveying information or expression of original ideas in a consecutive way in the new language”. And also According to Gelb (1952:12), writing is clearly a system of human intercommunication by means of conventional visible marks, but it is evident from what has been said that what the primitives understood as writing is not the same thing as what we do. Writing began at the time when man learned how to communicate his thought and feeling by means of visible signs, understandable not only to himself but also to all other people more or less initiated into the particular system.

Writing is a complex activity. Writing is a difficult subject, especially for students. Heaton (1989: 135) states that writing is complex and difficult to teach and also learn, requiring mastery not only of grammatical and theoretical devices but also of conceptual and judgmental elements. Halliday in (Nunan, 1991) stated that writing evolves in society as a result of cultural changes creating communicative needs which cannot be readily met by the spoken language.

Starting at the theories above, it can be taken a conclusion that writing is a part of skill in English learning activities and has a different characteristic with other skills. Writing composed of sentences that have a important meaning for the reader as well as writing needs organizing idea to share the information for the reader. Therefore, the writer make the reader easy understanding the content from paragraph and the purpose of the text was made by the writer.

Procedure Text

Procedure text can be seen from two keys perspectives. They are a thing that can be recorded, analyzed and discussed and a process that is the outcome of a socially produced occasion (Knapp, 2005:13). One of the text which is learned by the Junior High School is procedure text. According to Mark and Kathy Anderson, a procedure is a piece of text that gives us instructions for doing something. From that statement, can be understood that procedure text gives us the direction or the ways to do something (Knapp, 2005:13). Meanwhile, the procedure text explain the way or steps to do or to make something, it also consists of what tools or ingredients should be prepared. Mark and Kathy Anderson added that the examples of procedurere text are recipes, itineraries, instruction manuals, and direction (Knapp, 2005:13).

Knapp and Watkins say that procedure text is concerned with showing information to someone how to do something. From this statement, the procedure text generally organize with the goal, materials/ equipment and steps (Knapp, 2005:157). A procedure enable people to do or to make things something new for them and it is also make sure that they should do or make something in correct order. Every step in procedure text needs to be done. Procedure text itself provides a good information both for teacher and students because it provides the project that can be applied. Procedure text is not only learned as a text based in learning, but also it can be learned through project based. The project can be used in daily life, so procedure text is important to be learned and practiced.

Procedure text in material for Junior High School, it consists of various kinds of procedure. It is not only talk about how to make some foods or handcraft but also how to operate or do something. But in this study, the writer will be focus on the improving students in writing procedure text because regarding to the research questions, the writer would like to seek the information about does the demonstration method can be effective in improving students” writing procedure text. The procedure text has goal that will create the result. The result of procedure is the reflection of the goal.
If you want to make fried rice, you will create a step to make fried rice. So, the result of what did you do through the step of procedure, it will serve a fried rice as a sign that you have done.

As Hamer states previously that writing is a process that we write is often heavily influenced by constraints of genres, then these elements have to be present in learning activities (Harmer, 2004). There are various genre in writing procedure text. Genre itself defined as category assigned on the basis of external criteria such as intended audience, purpose and activity type (Barnard & Herbst, 2018). It means that genre explains certain types of activities. Genre in Procedure text includes recipes, directions, instruction manuals, administrative procedures, maintenance notices, advice texts, rules etc. According to (Anderson & Karthwohl, 2008a), procedure text has generic structure as follows:

a. An Introductory statement that gives their goal. This is the title of text and it also an introductory paragraph.

b. A list of the materials that will be needed for completing the procedure (not required for all procedural texts). This is a list or a paragraph and it will mention the step that maybe left out in some procedures.

c. A sequence of steps in the order they need to be done, because goal followed by a series of steps oriented to achieving the goal.

It is a numbers can be used to show first, second, third and soon steps in making something. Actually the order is usually important such word as now, next, after this. It will show what we should do next. And for the steps, it usually begin with a command such as add, stir, or push etc. (Anderson & Karthwohl, 2008b). The explanation above, it can be concluded that here are three points of generic structure of procedure text which is crucial and it can be stated without ones. Because they are in one unity to achieve a social function, it is to tell someone how to do something or how to make how to operate something. Besides having social generic structure, procedure text also has significant grammatical features that support the form of a procedure text. They are:

a. Simple Present Tense. Especially imperative form eventually, procedure text has the social function is to tell someone to do something. So, the instruction here is used by imperative verb in present tense. For examples get, chop, cut, stir, add, boil, grind, etc.

b. Connective of sequence. Sometimes, that is not enough to make a good instruction just using imperative form of present tense. But, to make it better and easy to follow, we need the word like as then, after that, next, finally, etc. These are called comparative sequence.

c. Numbering. The function of numbering here is same as comparative of sequence. It will be needed if the writer wants to show some variant of sequence, for examples: first, second, third, fourth and etc.

**Grammatical error**

The researcher found the grammatical error did by 20 students based on their worksheets 65. The recapitulation of error they made can be seen in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students’ Initial Names</th>
<th>Frequencies of Errors Types</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Om</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABW</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFH</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVW</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPNW</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAH</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INW</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAW</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAH</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Veronika Nurdelima Mendrofa, Adieli Iaoli / An Analysis of Grammatical Errors in Writing The Procedure Text of The Ninth Grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botumuzoi in 2022/2023
The previous table indicates that in column 1 (students are the initial name of 20 students. Then column two are the frequency of omission (Om) done by students. Column 3 are frequency of Addition (Add) done by students. Column 4 are frequency of Mis-information (Mis-in) done by students. And column 5 are frequency of Mis-ordering (Mis-or) done by students. From the table 4.1 can be seen the number of error done by students in writing procedure text based on types. They can be classified as follows:

a. Omission. Based on the analysis, the omission done by 20 students in writing procedure text were 48 (forty-eight) words. The sample of data can be seen below. ABW’s text: Pour some water the glass. This sentence showed that student did error at type of omission. Based on the full of text the ABW meant making the procedure text about making a cup of tea. Hopefully to make correct sentence, “pour some hot water into the glass”. Here ABW omitted words, “hot and into”. So the sentence seemed not clear.

b. Addition. Based on the analysis, addition done by 20 students in writing procedure text were 32 (thirty-two) words. The sample of the data can be seen as follows: PIW’s text: “After that loiled the vegetables in a pan for 15 minutes”. This sentence showed that the student did error at type addition. The error was word “boiled”. It should be “boil” because the sentence means instruct to do something. It need to apply the imperative sentence. In imperative sentence we always use verb 1 not verb 2 or verb 3. So the correct verb used in that sentence is verb 1 (boil). The correct sentence is “after that boil the vegetables in a pan for 15 minutes”.

c. Misformation. Based on the analysis, misinformation done by 20 students in writing procedure text were 66 (sixty-six) words. The sample of data can be seen below. MAH’S text: “Put two spoon of sugar into the cup”. This sentence showed that the student did error at type of omission. The error was word “spoon”. It should be “spoons” because word “two” signalled plural so the noun after word “two” should be added by letter “s”.

d. Misordering. Based on the analysis, misordering done by 20 students in writing procedure text were 36 (thirty-six) words. The sample of data can be seen follows. UNH’s text: “Then wash chili and onion red with the clean water”. This sentence showed that the error done by UNH classified at misordering type. The error was the position of onion red. In English adjective should be placed before noun. It is different with Indonesian. The correct sentence is “then was chili and red union with the clean water”.

---

Veronika Nurdelima Mendrofa, Adieli Laoli / An Analysis of Grammatical Errors in Writing The Procedure Text of The Ninth Grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi in 2022/2023
Dominant error

After classifying the error the researcher found the dominant error based on the percentage. Here the percentage of each type is total of frequencies of each type \( \times \frac{100}{182} \). It resulted the omission type done by students in writing procedure text was 26.37\%. The addition type done by students in writing procedure text was 17.58\%. the misinformation done by students in writing procedure text was 36.26\%. then misordering type done by the students in writing procedure text was 19.78\%. from this percentage can be concluded that the dominant error done by ninth students of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi was misinformation type.

Cause of errors

In finding the cause of errors done by students the researcher ask some question through questionnaires to english teacher and students. The questionnaire result of teacher indicates that the students often make errors in using plural, misspelling, grammar and the lack of vocabulary. These errors caused by the lack of knowledge in English. It categorized in intralingual transfer factor or cause.

Beside that, the researcher also has got data through questionnaires about the cause of errors done by students in writing procedure text. Based on the data shows that there are 16 students or 80\% students made error because of the lack of knowledge such as the lack of vocabulary, mispelling, misordering of words position or grammar. It can be seen by the reasons given by students through questionnaire. The sample data can be seen as follows:

ABW:
Q13 : Why did not you complete some
text in your procedure text?
A13 : Because i do not know how to say
them in english.

This reason belongs to the lack vocabulary. It mean that the ABW did error because the lack of vocabulary. This cause can be categorized as interlingual transfer factors. From the data also showed there were 4 persons of students (20\%) did errors in writing procedure text because of the effect of indonesian structure. It can be seen with the sample of data below:

UNH:
Q14 : Why did you place noun before
adjective in arrange phrases, “water
hot”?
A14 : Because in Indonesian noun is the
First. Then it followed by adjective . I
just applied its structure in English.

This reason belongs to the effect of mother tongue language. This cause can be categorized in interlingual transfer.

Discussion

This study aims to find the types of error errors and also the cause of errors done by ninth grade students of SMP Negeri 5 botomuzoi. Based on the finding the result of the research supports the statement of Krashen (1982: 154-162; James 2013, p.157) that errors consist of four types. They are omission, addition, misinformation and misordering. It different with the preview study done by Nugraha (2022, p.112). It found that only three types of error in the journal entitled, “Error Analysis in Writing Procedure Text of The Ninth Grade Students of SMP N 4 Juwana Pati in the Academic Year
2021/2022”. It found 3 types of errors, namely omission, addition, and misinformation with 18 data omission (42.85%), the addition of 17 data (40.47%), and 7 data misinformation (16.66%). The dominant was omission type. While in this study found four types of error done by students namely omission was 26.37%, addition was 17.58%, misinformation was 36.26% and misordering was 19.78%. The dominant was the misinformation type.

Furthermore this study aimed to find the cause of errors done by students. Based on the research finding indicated that in general the error caused by interlingual and interlingual transfer. It supports the theory of Hourani (2008:42), the student’s error commonly is caused by the language transfer of the student itself. But in this study found the specific cause. In interlingual transfer caused by the structure of Indonesian language. So the students only arrange the words in making sentence based on the Indonesian language structure. While the intralingual transfer caused by the lack of vocabulary, spelling, the use of plural and making noun phrases. Those caused the students made errors in writing procedure text.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on data analysis the researcher concluded the research finding as follows: 1) The types of errors done by 20 persons of students at ninth grade of SMP Negeri 5 Botomuzoi were four types namely omission, addition, misinformation and misordering. The dominant type was misinformation. 2) the cause of errors were interlingual transfer, included the influence of mother tongue structure and intralingual transfer, includes the lack of vocabulary, mispelling, the use of plural and making noun phrases.

REFERENSI


